Tutunamayanlar (1972) OĞUZ ATAY

regarded to have transformed the scene of Turkish literature with its revolutionary form as well as with its striking content and language.

a breakthrough in the history of the Turkish literature

its inventive narrative features

its unsettling impact on the following works of art

the reception of the novel slowly changed from negative to positive over the course of the four decades (the second publication of the novel in 1984)

Omer Madra: the Turkish intelligentsia (of which Oğuz Atay was a member) chose to ignore the novel upon its advent, partly due to the criticism the novel directed unto this class.

Enis Batur: the literary circles, which operated on the principle of seniority, received the novel with an inert anger masked under tolerance.

Yıldız Ecevit: at the end of 1960s, the conventions of the Turkish novel were still strictly tied to realism with the exception of a few avant-garde works and, hence, was not ready for *Tutunamayanlar* (in *Ben Buradayım*)

Nurdan Gürbilek

Gürbilek defines the 1980s (the decade in which the reception of *Tutunamayanlar* began to change) as the time of "the return of the repressed"

- "what had up until then been repressed, subjected, robbed of the possibilities of cultural expressions during the constitution of the modern identity of Turkey returned in some ways in the 1980s" as a result of the political, economic, social and cultural changes following the military coup d'état.
- She notes, however, that the repressed was neither truly repressed nor returned as such, being transformed and transforming in the process.
- Gürbilek maintains that the 1980s may be delineated as the times when the Turkish discovered the periphery/marginalization both within and without: the third world within the Turkish people as well as outside them. The 1980s were the times when the desire for individualization was felt all the more intensely because of its belatedness, but also when that which is called desire had never been subjected to the others' desire.
- In relation to literature, she observes that "literature was on the lookout for its autonomous principles", while it was exposed to the familiar pressures of the market. As regards history, the increasing interest in the past was simultaneously accompanied by a notion of (pop) history without historical weight.
- The reception of and critical approach to Tutunamayanlar changed in accordance with the political, social and cultural transformations in Turkey.

Berna Moran

- The source of inspiration for Atay is modernist Western literature
- Tutunamayanlar constitutes the first example of a new kind of perspective of the novel (i.e. modernist and post-modernist novel) in Turkish, while it still shares certain thematic concerns with the preceding literary works.
- Most literary scholars stress the influence on Atay of prominent Western texts and authors such as Bible, Don Quixote (Cervantes), Hamlet (Shakespeare), A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man and Ulysses (Joyce), The Metamorphosis and The Trial (Kafka) as well as the several works of Nabokov and Dostoevsky, while also underscoring the technical properties of the novel which makes it both modernist and postmodern at one and the same time.
- Atay blends his inspiration coming from previous major texts with his cultural experience in unexpected ways that the result is an original work.
- Translated into Dutch and German so far, unavailable in English yet.

- the focus on the problems of the individual (rather than on social injustices of the earlier novels) and the revolt of the individual against the bourgeois mentality.
- the title of the novel is the most obvious token of this theme of revolt against the common mindset.
- The novel is the story of the disconnected and an account of how to become a disconnected in a world which belongs to the connected.
- The connected are those who unquestioningly embrace the values of the bourgeois existence in which they find themselves and lead almost identical lives with exactly the same patterns, whereas the disconnected are the ones who cannot abide by these standards of judgment and, as a result, drawn to the periphery as the minority/marginalized inevitably.
- If Selim is (a) born (to be the) disconnected, Turgut learns to be one through the traces Selim has left behind.
- There are passages which manifest Turgut's recent awakening to the banality and conformity of the connected's lives.
- The novel shows, by the means of Turgut's life, that all the details of everyday life in the bourgeois order are permeated with this flat identity and lack of individuation: every small part (family, marriage, sexuality, office, relationships...etc) is an uncritical imitation and repetition of a wider general order.

- Atay attempts to undercut more than one order, system or approach, if not all.
- official history and national ideology
- a witty critique of Kafkaesque bureaucracy
- a critical revolt against reading practices and literary conventions
- a criticism of bourgeois art in general and literature in particular
- a manifestation of the discontent with civilization.
- Literary analysis also gets its share
- A critical analysis on this uncompromising novel is an ironic gesture

The Beginning of the End

- The main text of the novel is preceded by two fictional prefaces and followed by (an excerpt from) Turgut's letter to the journalist.
- The first preface ("The Beginning of the End") is written by the journalist who tells the reader that the novel *Tutunamayanlar* is the text which Turgut sent him after they met on a train. He goes on to disclose that as the story is based on true events and people, some changes, in accordance with the directions Turgut gives in his letter, are made.
- The second preface is written by the publisher, who, in contrast with the journalist, encourages readers not to take the events and the characters for real and suggests the incongruity of the characters and events to the people of "our country" as an evidence for their fictionality.
- The first preface: all-too-familiar content and language of prefaces
- The second preface undercuts the first preface
- A play on the status and claim of the text
- as an attention to the textuality of the novel
- Atay may be claimed to be mocking the conventions of the realistic novel by juxtaposing two contradictory prefaces (the first representing the familiar preface template, the second Atay's ironic approach)

The main text and events of the novel also begin with the arrival of another text: Selim's letter. The content of the letter is not fully revealed to the reader. Yet, the reader is made to understand that Selim has committed suicide and something in the letter makes Turgut bring the pieces and traces left by Selim together.

- In the beginning, Turgut is not ready to undertake it. Selim's death and letter interferes with Turgut's plans and, thus Turgut tries to forget about the letter and Selim, struggles to continue his life in its previous habitual convenience. Yet the reminiscences, texts, memories, ideas do not let him do so.
- It is as if with Selim's death, Selim's critical outlook passes on to Turgut, who, somehow, has managed to live free of it until then. Once he is contracted with this critical perspective, he cannot lead his bourgeois existence any more. He begins to recapture all the traces Selim has left behind through texts and friends. Turgut's search for Selim brings Selim in bits and pieces to the knowledge of the reader. In the meantime, Turgut becomes alienated from his family, friends and job by and by until one morning, after much hesitation, he leaves his home to "go to the lands where Selim was born" and become a disconnected.
- On his physical and psychical journey in the quest of becoming a disconnected and identifying wholly with Selim, Turgut begins to live on the trains travelling hither and thither, buys many books by writers such as Tolstoy, Dostoevsky, Dickens, Kafka, Goethe, Cervantes, Gorki and Ömer Seyfeddin and reads the rest of the texts left by Selim. Turgut's story resumes back when the diary of Selim ends with his suicide.
- And all of these different texts make up the text of the novel Tutunamayanlar
- The story line is quite straightforward and simple.
- What makes the novel contemporary is the inventive narrative techniques and innovative language Atay deploys, and their relation to the content

Modernist and/or Postmodern: Jameson versus Lyotard

- Critical debates regarding the distinction or lack thereof between modernism and postmodernism
- Some critics argue that there is an irreversible difference between modernism and postmodernism.
- Others regard postmodernism to be a continuum and integral part of modernism.
- Fredric Jameson is from the first group (there is a distinction)
- He approaches the discussion from a sociological framework and asserts that even if the features of modernism and postmodernism are shown to be indistinguishable, there is still a substantial difference between modernist art and postmodern art, which is basically the changes in the production and perception of artistic work.
- According to Jameson, contemporary art is inescapably postmodern in some ways, since it is produced in the cultural and artistic environment of the late stage of capitalism, where aesthetic production has become an integral part of commodity production.
- He believes that postmodern is marked by "a new depthlessness," "a consequent weakening of historicity," "a schizophrenic structure," all of which are closely tied to "a whole new technology" and "a whole new economic world system."
- Lyotard belongs to the second group (no distinction) and claims that postmodern is intrinsic to modernism. In the place of all the negative properties Jameson associates with postmodernism, one can find the enriching and liberating possibilities postmodernism provide for the art and the artist in Lyotard's account. For him, a postmodern artist is like a philosopher, whose work is in the pursuit of the principles and rules, but not governed by them.

Tutunamayanlar: Modernist or Postmodern

- textual and conceptual properties branded as postmodern are predominant in the novel.
- Tutunamayanlar is dominated by anarchy, absence, deconstruction, irony, indeterminacy, uncertainty rather than hierarchy, presence, construction, metaphysics, determinacy or certainty.
- There is no meta-discourse according to which every other part is evaluated.
- Neither is there a hierarchically absolute system which operates the various parts of the novel.
- Every components of the novel seem to exist horizontally rather than vertically in the novel.
- Although Turgut is portrayed as a follower of Selim, who wants to ascend to the level of the latter, this is more of an idealized relationship, rather than a hierarchical one.
- The only motive of the narration seems to be constant undercutting and undermining of all the systems without recourse to a single system.
- Accordingly, the tone of the novel is dominated by an inexhaustible irony and the basic strategy is apparently deconstruction. Endless textual plays, constant parody, innumerable references to historical personas, overt allusions to certain earlier texts, countless repetition of certain quotes and phrases are all registers of postmodern literature.
- The predominance of absence over presence is revealed by the death of Selim, while that uncertainty over certainty by the end of the novel: there is no information about the journey of Turgut.

Caution

- This type of analysis, however, is doomed to remain on a basically descriptive level, leaving aside as much it covers.
- It does not provide a meaningful explanation into the reasons for the possible relevance of this predominance of postmodern elements to the entirety of the novel.
- Moreover, this kind of listing is, in the last instance, based on the idea that there are irreversibly essential differences between modernism and postmodernism which make them mutually exclusive and that a text is either one or the other.
- Tutunamayanlar is a good example to show that a contemporary novel can contain both modernist features and postmodern properties.
- Accordingly, critical writings on *Tutunamayanlar* go beyond this schism between modernism and postmodernism and demonstrate that the novel contain narrative features of both artistic movements, without eliminating their differences.

Scholarship on Tutunamayanlar

- Berna Moran argues that Tutunamayanlar is at one and at the same time a modernist and postmodernist novel, which turns its face away from realism.
- According to Moran, Tutunamayanlar is connected to modernism through the deep impact on Atay of Joyce and to postmodernism through the profound influence of Nabokov.
- Yildiz Ecevit contends that with its problematization of writer and writing and countless references to earlier literary texts, the novel is the first example of metafiction in Turkish novel.
- Jale Parla claims that modernist and postmodern elements are intertwined to the themes and characters of the novel by pointing out the parallel between the passage from Selim's depression to Turgut's schizophrenia in the novel and the passage from modernism to postmodernism in literature.

Tutunamayanlar's relation with modernism and postmodernism

- Textual wealth: The variety of the different types of texts the novel contain is astonishingly rich.
- The novel includes two different types of prefaces (one parody of the other), letters (sometimes even to Jesus Christ), encyclopedic entries (for example, on "disconnectus erectus" from the Encyclopedia of Weird Creatures), a clinical diary, songs, commentary on and analysis of songs, poems, pieces of personal notes, lecture notes, biographies etc.
- Atay enriches this textual wealth more with his word plays, textual games, intertextual references, pastiche, uncompromising satire and irony, touching on some iconic subjects and figures (prophets, the founder of Turkey, religious texts etc.)
- Pastiche: many examples of pastiches in the novel
- Atay openly imitates a part of previous work of art, most often with a touch of satirical or intent, making connections between artistic texts.
- One example is Turgut's ironic satire of bureaucracy is amalgamated with the ten commandments of the Holy Book. Another is where the first hearing of Josph K. in *The Trial* by Kafka is adapted to Turgut's case
- All the above mentioned technical novelties accompanied by an unyielding irony and a constant undermining of all systems seem to connect it with postmodern art more than modernism.

Tutunamayanlar and Modernism

- one of the reasons that Tutunamayanlar had to wait over a decade to get the attention of the critics and to appeal to a wider number and range of readers is that the established reading practices were not ready for the revolutionary form and content of the novel.
- Tutunamayanlar did what modernists did a couple of decades ago in the West: it repudiated the prevalent literary conventions and bourgeois order. The rebellious quality of Tutunamayanlar comes from its constant challenge and violation of the principles of gesthetic expression as well as the bourgeois norms.
- In contrast with the "depthlessness," "weakening of historicity," elimination of alienation, lack of lack and "fragmentation" of subjectivity Jameson associates with contemporary art, *Tutunamayanlar* retains a strong sense of historicity.
- Alienation and lack are the most obvious markers of the narrative, which lends a sense depth to the novel.
- The novel is a reaction against the "whole new economic world system."
- Most importantly, the tension between life and art is still very much alive. There is a quite modernist approach in the strained relationship between art and life. Selim may be claimed to be a modernist who seeks the protection of art in the face of real life.

- Only art can soothe the restless soul of Selim against the unpredictability and pains of the real life.
- There are passages which emphasize the priority and primacy of art over life: Selim thinks that daily incidents are more fictional than fiction itself and prefers his daily life to be fictional.
- Selim wants to turn one type of factual writing, biography, into fiction: he wants to write fictional biographies, especially fictional stories for private life of Christ.
- Tutunamayanlar may be claimed to be simultaneously tied to modernism and postmodernism. If its narrative techniques make the novel a part of postmodernism, the unending tension, the marked alienation and lack, endless struggle with the system, inexhaustible attack on all forms of meta-operations, the emphasized relation between art and life make the novel a modernist novel.

Jale Parla on Tutunamayanlar

- Parla claims that two themes in literature have been and will be the source of all the narratives: the themes of reality/illusion and sanity/madness.
- Don Quixote, underscoring both of the two themes, has been the muse for all the subsequent novels. Tutunamayanlar, she goes on to say, features on the theme of sanity/madness.
- Madness/insanity makes room for all kinds of idiosyncrasy, absurdism, eccentricity, incongruity, plays and games which would not find a place in a more conventional novel. The theme of madness/insanity also strengthens the ironic tone of the novel. With all the freedom madness/insanity provides, the author is liberated to undermine anything. Parla claims that "a language identified with madness/insanity abolishes all the systems."
- In the novel, being a disconnected is associated with being mad/insane: even if the terms do not mean exactly the same thing, they share a common status in society, which pushes them to the periphery, while still keeping them under control.
- Turgut still hesitates to designate himself as disconnected proper. He is still not sure how truly a disconnected he is in the eyes of Selim, who is a true disconnected.

Berna Moran asks why Atay chooses Jesus Christ as a key figure

- He explains that Christ is the archetype of all the disconnected.
- Selim is a born disconnected: he never gives in to the prevalent order.
- His awe for and identification with authors (Wilde, Gorki) changes through time-even in some cases turn to hatred, from one phase in his life to another,
- Yet, his strong idealization of Jesus never changes: Christ is his idol and prototype.
- Selim has always been a rather complicated and complex character, the diary of his last days is a proof of what Parla calls his depression. Selim shows evident symptoms of a deep depression, which results in his suicide.
- Turgut, on the other hand, learns to be a disconnected by following Selim in a later stage of his life. Thus Turgut's ties to Christ are of a secondary nature, compared to Selim. The process of changing from being a connected to a disconnected involves serious confusion, disarray and obstacles for Turgut.
- Still, he initiates the process slowly but determinedly to be able to completely identify with Selim. The impact of this arduous process is schizophrenia: Turgut undergoes a split of the character and Olric, his imaginary servant, comes into being.

- The appearance of Olric signals a profound change in the definition of life and selfhood for Turgut.
- While previously there are no considerable tensions between the inner and external world of Turgut, Olric's appearance coincides with the unbridgeable division between the interiority and exteriority of Turgut.
- He is completely alienated to his previous lifestyle and finds it difficult to continue his former routine.
- The more he is lost in his inner world with Olric and Selim, the more he loses his sense of the outside world, time and space.
- The meaning of reality changes from the material success to being true to one's desire, even if that means complete failure and insanity in his former order.
- The pressures on his severely divided life are partially reduced when he leaves his home and all his previous obligations behind.

Belatedness

- a strong feeling of being belated accompanies Turgut's schizophrenia
- He wishes that he were born today, that Selim had not died.
- He is ashamed to think that until a while ago he has led a completely cheap life and regards it as a dark shade or stain.
- He regrets that Olric had not warned him before.
- there is something paradoxical about his regrets and wishful desires.
- If Selim had not died, he would most probably be leading his usual routine.
- Turgut's feelings are the consequences of what he has experienced: he would not feel the way he feels, if he had not undergone them.
- Olric, one part of Turgut's disturbed psyche, comforts him saying that it is possible to do what Turgut wants to do.

Jameson, Postmodernism, and Schizophrenia

- While trying to delineate the essential properties of postmodernism, Jameson comes up with Lacanian schizophrenia as a useful term to fathom the experience of postmodernism.
- He explains that in schizophrenic cases where the signifying chain breaks down, resulting in pure Signifiers without meaningful/comprehensible ties to other signifiers.
- Similarly, in postmodern culture, personal identity suffers from a breakdown of the relationships between Signifiers, leaving the subject amidst a pile of incomprehensible, disconnected Signifiers and making him/her unable to relate to temporality.
- With the loss of sense of temporality, sense of alienation and anxiety is eliminated.
- What substitutes the sense of alienation is "joyous intensities."

Turgut

- Turgut's case, whilst containing some of the traits Jameson brings forward, still encloses some features which Jameson claims to have disappeared in contemporary art.
- Turgut experiences a fragmentation of the self. Yet, this fragmentation of the self does not replace the sense of alienation at all.
- The sense of alienation is the cause of the fragmentation.
- The entire text of the novel is permeated with the sense of anxiety.
- The loss of the sense of temporality represents psychological regress accompanying a process of grand transformation, instead of instant "joyous intensities."
- In a way, Jameson's notion of postmodern schizophrenia does not adequately capture Tutunamayanlar's multifaceted layers of meaning and Turgut's schizophrenia.

Why not fully sczhiphronic?

- The developments in the Turkish literature are not synchronic with the developments in the Western literature and in the 1970s Tutunamayanlar appeared against a background of a still-strictly realist literature.
- Thus, what Atay did with *Tutunamayanlar* in Turkish literature is comparable to what the modernists did in the West several decades ago.
- The conditions in which works of art are produced, perceived and consumed may be claimed to have still been different in comparison with the West.
- In this regard, the novel can be seen as modernist, not postmodern.

Marshall Berman All That Is Solid Melts Into Air (1982)

- According to Berman, the modernism of underdevelopment at once feeds on fantasies and phantasms of modernity and tries to remain loyal to its cultural origins.
- Sometimes it exalts itself for its undertakings, at other times it agonizes itself for its failures.
- Most of the time, it can sustain itself only through self-irony and self-loathing.
- Berman thinks that it is this "bizarre reality" and "the unbearable pressures under which it moves and lives –social and political pressures as well as spiritual ones" that lend the modernism of underdevelopment its acute intensity, which is hard to find in the modernism of the advanced nations.
- Thus, cultural difference may account for the diversity, intensity, and wealth Jameson's description fails to summon.

Daryush Shayegan and "cultural schizophrenia"

- Daryosh Shayegan's notion "cultural schizophrenia" complements both Berman's statement and Turgut's schizophrenia.
- Shayegan describes cultural schizophrenia as "the mental distortions afflicting those civilizations that have remained on the sidelines of history and played no part in the festival of changes."
- According to Sheyagan, the non-Western subject experiences "a time of conflict between different blocs of knowledge, [...] incompatible worlds that mutually repel and deform one another."
- Turgut's schizophrenia results from two incompatible worlds: the world of bourgeois order and his inner world. The first world is based on a superficial imitation of Western lifestyle.
- While Selim has always been critical of this kind of life, Turgut realizes its superficiality and failure only with the loss of Selim.
- With this realization, the second type of world comes into being, or rather begins to have serious conflicts with the first world.
- The latter convinces Turgut to leave the former behind and follow Selim, which is not easy.
- Not only is the now-deceased Selim surrounded by many canonical western texts, but also Turgut again to the light but feel he's already late.
- (given through many references to official national history and ideology, Turkish historiography, language reform, the cultural division of East/West underscored by the modernization period, all treated with irony)

Biography of Turgut

- "Hüsnü Bey pek dindar sayılmazdı. Turgut'un kulağına ezanı fısıldarken de gene, Kadim Yunan gibi, bilmediği bir düzenin ezberciliğini yapıyordu. Doğu ve Batı kültürünün sembolleri, onun kafasında, bütün ürkütücü yönleriyle, birbirlerine karışmadan durabiliyordu." (56)
- Mr Hüsnü was not particularly religious. When he was whispering the religious hymns into the ear of infant Turgut, he was doing what he had done with Ancient Greek: he memorized what he could not understand. Symbols of Eastern and Western cultures, in his mind, remained separate with all their frightening aspects
- The passage goes on to tell, in a ironic manner, the influence of this first encounter with the Eastern civilization on Turgut's later life.
- The normal state of things would be to be able to integrate the different parts and reach a harmonious level. If conflicting or simply distinct parts are not incorporated into one another, the split of the character is inevitable. In this short passage, it is possible to locate Turgut's schizophrenia in a more cultural context and connect it with the wider cultural schizophrenia on a national level.
- Turgut's schizophrenia has undertones of being related more generally to civilization than the specific experience of (post)modernity.

Civilization and Its Discontents

- Turgut's schizophrenia and Selim's depression is closely related to what Freud terms "civilizations and its discontents."
- The most basic question Selim asks himself ("what is to be done?") is in fact the most difficult question the modern human beings have to ask themselves.
- The tension the question brings forward entails the conflict between civilization and individual.
- The individual is struck between his/her drives and the restrictions civilization places upon them.
- Freud believes that "the two processes of individual and of cultural development must stand in hostile opposition to each other and mutually dispute the ground," as the first process aims at "personal happiness" and the second at "union with other human beings." (Civilization and Its Discontents, 88)
- Freud thinks that there is a certain price human race has to pay in exchange of civilization: a loss of happiness.
- Freud underlines a heightened sense of guilt. The split of the self brought about by two incompatible processes can be easily contained in the picture.

Selim

- As for *Tutunamayanlar*, Selim seems to be a character who is aware of the inevitable dilemma these two oppositional processes bring along more consciously than any other character. He openly complains about civilization, saying that he has not benefited from civilization.
- Turgut, on the other hand, can be said to have submitted himself to the process of civilization and merging his personal happiness process harmoniously with it, until the arrival of Selim's letter. Only with the mediation of Selim that Turgut begins to separate one process from the other.
- The notion culture becomes more problematic, especially in the context of non-Western world and Selim draws upon it through the heightening of cultural difference/dominance in his biographical sketch of Turgut

- Kültür, sadece bazı isimleri hatırlamaktan ibaret değildir, deniliyordu. Kültür, bu isimleri yerli yerinde ve başka isimlerle münasebetini bilerek kullanmak demekti. Kelimeler, kelimeler... diye düşündü Hüsnü Bey, Shakespeare'in adını bile duymadığı halde. Bu kelimeler, kültür mü demekti? Hakikaten, kültür ne demek acaba? Hüsnü Bey için kültür onun dört kere tek dersten sınıfta kalmasına sebep olan Amme hocası Ordinaryüs Profesör -o zamanki adıyla müderris- Ekrem Galip Bey (Aydıner) demekti. Eğer böyleyse, 'Kültür', insanı küçümseyen, insanın ne mal olduğunu bir bakışta anlayan iri kıyım bir şey demekti. (54)
- Culture is not to merely remember certain names, it is said. Culture is to use these names fully knowing their relation to other names and concepts. Words, words... thought Mr. Hüsnü, although he never heard the name Shakespeare. These names, did they mean culture? What is culture? For Mr. Hüsnü, culture was Professor Ekrem Galip (Aydıner), who failed him four times. If culture is this, then it must be a big mass that evaluates one quickly and condescendingly.

Shortcomings of a masterpiece

- Despite all of its fascinating and ground-breaking aspects, Tutunamayanlar contains a number of persistently conventional characteristics.
- The novel is an exclusively male novel.
- Not only is the book an (auto)biographical fiction about two male protagonists and most of the characters are male, but also the representation of women, when it rarely takes place, are not very heartwarming.
- Tutunamayanlar is one of the landmarks in literary modernism and one of the finest examples of (post)modernist novel in Turkish literature. The novel is a distinguished example of modernist literature, which breaks ties with the preceding movements of romanticism and realism through its literary innovations and novel narrative techniques, while its shortcomings in terms of its women characters from a feminist approach are hard to overpass.

WORKS CITED

- Atay, Oğuz. 2011 (1972). Tutunamayanlar. Istanbul: Iletişim Yayınları.
- Berman, Marshall. 1988. All That Is Solid Melts Into Air. N Y: Penguin.
- Ecevit, Yıldız. 2009a (2005). Ben Buradayım: Oğuz Atay'ın biyografik ve Kurmaca Dünyası. Istanbul: Iletişim.
- ---. 2009b (2001). Türk romanında Postmodern Açılımlar. Istanbul: Iletişim.
- Freud, Sigmund. 1961. Civilization and Its Discontents. James Strachey, trans. New York: W.W. Norton Company.
- Gürbilek Handan. (1992) Vitrinde Yaşamak. Istanbul: Iletişim Yayınları.
- Jameson, Fredric. 1991. Postmodernism or TheCultural Llogic of Late Capitalism.
- Lyotard. The Postmodern Condition.
- Moran, Berna. 2008 (1990). Türk Romanına Eleştirel Bir Bakış: Sebahattin Ali'den Yusuf Atılgan'a. Istanbul: Iletişim Yayınları,
- Parla, Jale. (2000). Don Kişot'tan Bugüne Roman. Istanbul: Iletişim Yayınları.
- Irzık, Sibel. 1995. "Tutunamayanlar'da Çok Seslilik ve Sınırları." Varlık, 1057.
- ---. 2003. "Allegorical Lives: The Public and the Private in the Modern Turkish Novel" in Relocating the Fault Lines, 551-67.
- Shayegan, Daryush. 2007 (1989). Cultural Schizophrenia: Islamic Societies Confronting the West.