

# Hispania, Al-Andalus, and the Crown of Castile: Architecture and Constructions of Identity

*Juan Carlos Ruiz Souza*

This article\* deals with how medieval Spanish architecture drew from the monuments of previous historical periods in a conscious attempt to appropriate the legitimacy of earlier civilizations and to forge unity in territories newly conquered by the Christians. The *Estoria de España*, written at the court of Alphonse X the Wise during the second half of the 13th century, mentions buildings and monuments from the Roman, Visigothic, and Andalusí periods. The church of St Romanus (San Román) in Toledo,<sup>1</sup> built during the tenure of Archbishop Don Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada in the second quarter of the 13th century, makes use of *spolia*, or reused construction materials from ancient buildings, mainly Roman and Visigothic columns and capitals. A century later, in the 1360s, Peter I of Castile built his palace, Cuarto Real, alongside the Plaza de la Montería in Seville's Alcázar. In this palace, we find Roman, Visigothic, and Andalusí *spolia*. Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, Alphonse X, and Peter I, in the different kinds of works they had a hand in creating, all appropriated the multi-cultural heritage of their territories to construct a Castilian identity. Interestingly, centuries earlier, Muslim rulers in al-Andalus, in Umayyad Cordoba (9th and 10th centuries) and Almohad Seville (12th century), had engaged in exactly the same kind of requisitioning of materials from the monuments of previous civilizations. Jiménez de Rada, Alphonse X, and Peter I made al-Andalus part of Spanish history. How did they do this? The cultural key is to be found in 12th-century Toledo, in the Christian Mozarab community.<sup>2</sup>

\* This article is part of the Research Project HAR2013-45578R "Al-Andalus, los Reinos Hispanos y Egipto: arte poder y conocimiento en el Mediterráneo medieval. Las redes de intercambio y su impacto en la cultura visual." PI: Susana Calvo Capilla and Juan Carlos Ruiz Souza.

- 1 Jerrilyn Dodds, "Rodrigo, Reconquest, and Assimilation: Some Preliminary Thoughts about San Román," in *Spanish Medieval Art: Recent studies*, ed. Colum Hourihane (Princeton, 2007), pp. 215–44; Juan Carlos Ruiz Souza, "Toledo entre Europa y Al-Andalus en el siglo XIII: Revolución, tradición y asimilación de las formas artísticas en la Corona de Castilla," *Journal of Medieval Iberian Studies* 1–2 (2009), 233–71.
- 2 Juan Carlos Ruiz Souza, "Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, Alfonso X y Pedro I ante las 'reliquias arquitectónicas' del pasado en la construcción de la identidad de España. Historicismos antiguos," in *Reyes y prelados. La creación artística en los reinos de León y Castilla (1050–1500)*,

## 1 Historiography's Partial Effacement of the Art of Al-Andalus

A great deal is changing in the view held of Islamic Spain and of the various ways in which al-Andalus was incorporated into the historical narrative of the Kingdom of Castile and León beginning in the Middle Ages. The historiography of Western art has long delayed in adapting its approaches in order to make sense of the messages that this art contains that go beyond questions of religion and form.<sup>3</sup>

Texts written in the 19th century, after the Enlightenment, consigned the original messages of the most important architectural projects in al-Andalus to oblivion.<sup>4</sup> It was not only that the intrinsic peculiarities (spatial, functional, and conceptual) of Islamic art as a whole were forgotten; it was unimaginable that its symbols might have political objectives similar to those embodied in the great works of medieval Christian art. Only with difficulty can the artistic symbols of a civilization be understood if the basic codes of interpretation are omitted. The art of al-Andalus was altered and reshaped by a romantic view that preferred to link it to the exotic and oriental, and therefore with the principles of a civilization considered morally inferior to Ancient Greece and Rome, which were the imagined sources of Christian European culture. Likewise, Andalusí art was partially effaced with the reinterpretation of Spanish art along nationalist lines. In other words, the categories of Mudéjar<sup>5</sup> and

- 
- eds. María Dolores Teijeira, María Victoria Herráez, and María Concepción Cosmen (Madrid, 2015), pp. 219–30.
- 3 Juan Carlos Ruiz Souza, "La Corona de Castilla y León en el siglo XIV: Creatividad y/o crisis. Un ejemplo de desenfoco historiográfico," in *La historiografía medieval ante la crisis*, ed. María Elisa Varela-Rodríguez, (Girona 2015), pp. 125–68; by the same author, "Al-Andalus e Hispania en la identidad del arte medieval español. Realidad y desenfoco historiográfico," in *Coexistencia y conflictos interreligiosos en el Mediterráneo (ss. XIV–XVIII)*, eds. Borja Franco, Bruno Pomara, Manuel Lomas, and Bárbara Ruiz (Valencia, 2016), pp. 375–94.
  - 4 For example, the original meanings conveyed by the Court of the Lions in the Alhambra are absent from Washington Irving's *Tales of the Alhambra*, since he saw only a romantic palace and not an Islamic monument.
  - 5 José Amador de los Ríos, "El estilo mudéjar en Arquitectura. Discurso leído en Junta Pública de 19 Junio de 1859," in *Discursos leídos en las recepciones y actos públicos celebrados por la Real Academia de las Tres Nobles Artes de San Fernando desde 19 de Junio de 1859* (Madrid, 1872), vol. 1, pp. 1–73; Juan Carlos Ruiz Souza, "Le 'style mudéjar' en architecture cent cinquante ans après," *Perspective* 2 (2009), 277–86; Elie Lambert, "L'art mudéjar," *Gazette des Beaux Arts* 9 (1933), 17–33; George Marçais, "L'art musulman d'Espagne," *Hesperis* 22 (1936), 105–12, p. 112; Henri Terrasse, *L'art hispano-mauresque, des origines au XII<sup>e</sup> siècle* (Paris, 1932); Isidro G. Bango, "El arte de construir en ladrillo en Castilla y León durante la Alta Edad Media, un mudéjar inventado en el siglo XIX," in *Mudéjar iberoamericano*, eds. Rafael López Guzmán and Ignacio Henares (Granada, 1993), pp. 109–23; Judith Feliciano, *Mudejarismo in*

Mozarabic art<sup>6</sup> were developed by Spanish historiography as forms of Christian art (in their function and patronage) in order to lay claim to the decorative features of al-Andalus while protecting Christian art from the contaminating influences of Islam.

The above explains why the historiography of European architecture, which should also have included al-Andalus, found it difficult to do so. Not only was Andalusí architecture romanticized and reduced to its forms, it was difficult to automatically recognize spaces that had no equivalent in Western architecture. For example, the West did not have specific places in which teaching took place (*madrassas*) that could also be tied to famous mystics (*zawiya*, *janqa*) and where medicine – teaching and assistance – was practised (*maristan*), etc. Other types of spaces should also be recalled. As a quick summary, and at the risk of committing some errors, we can mention the following: *maylis*, which could serve as a ceremonial room or for meetings or intellectual discussion; *caravanserai*, which was a building where merchants and their wares were housed and which may have been looked after by a type of brotherhood, so its purpose could have been related to that of the *ribat* and *janqa*, places where holy men retreated to live communally; and *marabout*, which was a place linked to a great holy man which might become a place of pilgrimage. The meaning of these terms could change over time.<sup>7</sup>

The lack of parallels in Christian architecture and the tendency to romanticize the features of Andalusí architecture as signs of a primitive formalism has made it difficult for art historians to make sense of these buildings, to

---

*Its Colonial Context: Iberian Cultural Display, Viceregal Luxury Consumption, and the Negotiation of Identities in Sixteenth-Century New Spain*, PhD Diss. (Pennsylvania, 2004); Ana Reyes Pacios Lozano, *Bibliografía de arquitectura y techumbres mudéjares 1857–1991* (Teruel, 1993); Ana Reyes Pacios Lozano, *Bibliografía de Arte Mudéjar. Addenda* (Teruel, 2002); Gonzalo Borrás Gualis, *El Arte Mudéjar* (Teruel, 1990), pp. 13–36; Rafael López Guzmán, *Arquitectura Mudéjar* (Madrid, 2000), pp. 23–62; Manuel Gómez-Moreno, *Arte Mudéjar Toledano* (Madrid, 1916); Basilio Pavón, *Arte Toledano: islámico y mudéjar* (Madrid, 1988); Joaquín Yarza Luaces, *Historia del Arte Hispánico. 11. La Edad Media* (Madrid, 1980), p. 256: “...unas de las partes más mudejarizadas, Valencia, no lo refleja en su arte.”

6 Isidro G. Bango, “Un gravísimo error en la historiografía española, el empleo equivocado del término mozárabe,” in *El Legado de Al-Andalus. El arte andalusí en los reinos de León y Castilla durante la Edad Media*, ed. Manuel Valdés (Valladolid, 2007), pp. 73–88; José Camón Aznar, “Arquitectura española del siglo X. Mozárabe y de la Repoblación,” *Goya* 52 (1963), 206–19; Isidro G. Bango, “Arquitectura de la décima centuria: ¿Repoblación o Mozárabe?,” *Goya* 122 (1974), 68–75.

7 This problematic, and interesting, subject is scarcely addressed in European art historiography. However, George Makdisi’s works about the relationship and differences between the madrasa and the university should be noted, especially George Makdisi, “Madrasa and University in the Middle Ages,” *Studia Islámica* 32 (1970), 255–464.

understand that, before the Christian conquest, al-Andalus used architecture to convey messages about the identity of its civilization, and that this was later copied by the Christian kingdoms in the north of the Peninsula. Late Roman and Visigothic Hispania was revived as a source of legitimacy and political differentiation, first by al-Andalus and then by the Christian kingdoms.<sup>8</sup>

## 2 Making the Past Present: Salvaging Previously Used Construction Material or *Spolia*

Before continuing, let us consider the political dimension of the deliberate recycling of *spolia*, salvaged construction material, especially columns and capitals, in important architectural projects.<sup>9</sup> The use of construction material taken deliberately from structures built by previous civilizations (for political or economic reasons, for purposes of legitimization, etc.) has been a common practice throughout history. The 4th-century Roman arch of Constantine used construction material selected from monuments erected by Trajan, Adrian, and Marcus Aurelius, but not Nero or Caligula, for example. Therefore, the argument that this was done for purely financial or practical reasons unconnected to ideology is unconvincing, and we prefer a political and ideological reading, as Beat Brenk and Jas Elsner do.<sup>10</sup> The use of *spolia* was widespread throughout late antiquity, and we also see it in the Carolingian period, in Byzantium,<sup>11</sup> in Islamic territories,<sup>12</sup> and in the Kingdom of Asturias.<sup>13</sup>

8 About the problematic relationship between messages and forms, see Juan Carlos Ruiz Souza, "Castilla y al-Andalus. Arquitecturas aljamiadas y otros grados de asimilación," *Anuario del Departamento de Historia y Teoría del Arte* 16 (2004), 17–43.

9 Dale Kinney, "The Concept of Spolia," in *A Companion to Medieval Art: Romanesque and Gothic in Northern Europe*, ed. Conrad Rudolph (Oxford, 2006), pp. 233–52.

10 Beat Brenk, "Spolia from Constantine to Charlemagne: Aesthetics versus Ideology" *Dumbarton Oaks Papers* 41 (1987), 103–09; Jas Elsner, "From the Culture of Spolia to the Cult of Relics: The Arch of Constantine and the Genesis of Late Antique Forms," *Papers of the British School at Rome* 68 (2000), 149–84; Paolo Liverani, "Reimpiego senza ideología. La lettura antica degli spolia dall'arco di Costantino all'età carolingia," *Mitteilungen des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts, Römische Abteilung* 111 (2004), 383–434.

11 Franz Alto Bauer, "Sagenhafte Herkunft. Spolie im Umkreis des byzantinischen Kaisers," in *Spolien im Umkreis der Macht / Spolia en el entorno del poder*, eds. Thomas G. Schattner and Fernando Valdés Fernández (Mainz am Rhein, 2009), pp. 59–80.

12 Christian. Ewert, "Spolien, ihre islamischen Nachschöpfungen und ihre Musterschemata in den Hauptmoscheen von Córdoba un Qairawan," in *Spolien im Umkreis der Macht*, eds. Schattner and Valdés, pp. 287–304; Michael Greenhalgh *Constantinople to Córdoba: Dismantling Ancient Architecture in the East, North Africa and Islamic Spain* (Boston, 2012).

13 Isidro G. Bango Torviso, "Los expolios del paisaje monumental y la arquitectura hispana de los siglos VII al XI. Reflexiones sobre el proceso constructivo de San Miguel de Escalada,"

It is surprising to observe that the re-use of ancient material in emblematic buildings was similar in 9th-century Asturias, Cordoba, and Aachen. Charlemagne looked at Ravenna, the natural successor to Rome, and took building material from there for his projects in Aachen. Likewise, Alphonse II and the kings of Asturias who came after him, as well as Abd al-Rahman II, emir of Cordoba, sought their source of political legitimacy in Roman and Visigothic Hispania and did not hesitate to include in their most important buildings *spolia* from distant Hispano-Roman and Hispano-Visigothic buildings. In the 10th century, caliphs in Cordoba did the same in the city of Madinat al-Zahra.<sup>14</sup> Thus, we see similar processes at work in the far western areas of the former Roman Empire during late antiquity as we see elsewhere; here, too, new civilizations attempted to reclaim the validity of a partially lost order whose legitimate heirs they considered themselves to be and which explained their very existence.

### 3 Constructing Identity in the Kingdom of Castile: The Use of Roman and Visigothic Hispania and Al-Andalus by Archbishop Jiménez de Rada, Alphonse X, and Peter I

We start with the Kingdom of Castile in the Middle Ages. First, we should recall the ideas developed by the archbishop of Toledo, Jiménez de Rada,<sup>15</sup> and King Alphonse X in the 13th century following the victory of the Christians at Las Navas de Tolosa in 1212 against the Almohad Empire of Seville.<sup>16</sup> Both men devised a complete political project for the future that made possible the integration of Hispanic cultural diversity, including al-Andalus.<sup>17</sup>

---

*De Arte* 7 (2008), 7–50; by the same author, “El neovisigotismo artístico de los siglos IX–X: La restauración de ciudades y templos,” *Revista de las Ideas Artísticas* 37 (1979), 319–38; as well as, “L’Ordo Gothorum’ et sa survivance dans l’Espagne du Haut Moyen Age,” *Revue de l’Art* 70 (1985), 9–20; Lorenzo Arias, “Recurso a los ‘Spolia’ como instrumento de prestigio y poder en el arte prerrománico asturiano (siglos VIII–X),” in *Spolien im Umkreis der Macht*, pp. 199–228.

- 14 Susana Calvo Capilla, “Images and Knowledge of Classical Antiquity in the Palace of Madinat al-Zahra’ (Cordoba, 10th Century): Its Role in the Construction of the Caliphal Legitimacy,” *Muqarnas* 31 (2014), 1–33.
- 15 Peter Linehan, *History and the Historians of Medieval Spain* (Oxford, 1993), pp. 313–84; Pick, *Conflict and Coexistence*, pp. 73–79.
- 16 Isidro G. Bango (dir.), *Alfonso X el Sabio* (Murcia, 2009); Francisco Márquez Villanueva, *El concepto cultural alfonsí* (Madrid, 1994); Adeline Rucquoi, “El Rey Sabio: cultura y poder en la monarquía medieval castellana,” in *Repoblación y reconquista*, ed. Luis Hernando Garrido (Madrid, 1993), pp. 77–88.
- 17 Juan Carlos Ruiz Souza, “Alfonso X y el triunfo de la visualización del poder,” *Alcanate. Revista de Estudios Alfonsíes. Cátedra Alfonso X El Sabio* 8 (2012–13), 221–59.

The church of St Romanus (San Román) in Toledo, built during the last quarter of the 13th century, when Jiménez de Rada was the city's archbishop, is the fruit of a political project to reclaim the past in order to pave the way for the future.<sup>18</sup> Both the architectural qualities of the building and the paintings it contained reflect an attempt to unify, or at least permit the peaceful coexistence of, the two rival Christian liturgies existing in the city: the Roman or French rite, imposed on the city in the 11th century after Alphonse VI conquered it, and the Hispanic rite, also known as Visigothic or Toledan, which was of pre-Islamic origin. In his chronicle, Jiménez de Rada laments the loss of the Hispanic liturgy after Alphonse VI's conquest of the city.<sup>19</sup> And, we can find in St Romanus basilica a tribute to the Mozarab community and a reference to the fact that both rites were celebrated in Toledo. Former Roman and Visigothic material was used, and large horseshoe arches were built (Fig. 5.1). These were painted with a radial pattern to divide the voussoirs above the impost line, similar to pre-Islamic horseshoe arches, in an obvious allusion to the late Roman Christian origins of the city that the Mozarab community wished to join. The paintings, which were completed at the same time that the church was built,<sup>20</sup> show inscriptions in both Latin and Arabic. Arabic was the language of the Christians (Mozarabs) who adhered to the Hispanic rite during the period of Islamic rule in Toledo, between the 8th and 11th centuries, since, unsurprisingly, this community had gradually become Arabized over the centuries.<sup>21</sup> After Alphonse VI's arrival in 1086, the city became the spearhead of the reformed Roman rite promoted by the monarchy and Cluniac monks as a sign of the Europeanization of the Hispanic kingdoms.<sup>22</sup> This reformed liturgy was in many ways incompatible with the ancient and conservative liturgy of the Mozarabs. Paintings in St Romanus (San Román) (Fig. 5.2) also depict the fathers of the Hispanic church (St Isidore and St Leander of Seville), together with those identified with the Roman reform (St Gregory and St Bernard).<sup>23</sup>

The next phase in the appropriation of al-Andalus in the identity of the Kingdom of Castile and León was led by Alphonse X, the Wise. Alphonse X's

18 Dodds, "Rodrigo, Reconquest"; Pick, *Conflict and Coexistence*, pp. 73–79.

19 Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, *Historia de Rebus Hispanie sive Historia Gotica*, ed. Juan Fernández Valverde (Turnhout, 1987), vol. 6, p. 35.

20 Carmen Rallo Gruss, *Aportaciones a la técnica y estilística de la pintura mural en Castilla a final de la Edad Media. Tradición e influencia mudéjar* (Madrid, 2002), pp. 277–79.

21 About the Mozarab community, see Cyrille Aillet, *Les mozárabes. Christianisme, islamisation et arabisation en péninsule ibérique (IX<sup>e</sup>–XII<sup>e</sup> siècle)* (Madrid, 2010).

22 Juan Pablo Rubio Sadia, "El cambio de rito en Castilla: su *iter* historiográfico en los siglos XII y XIII," *Hispania Sacra* 58 (2006), 9–35.

23 Ruiz Souza, "Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada," pp. 219–29.

*scriptorium* produced the *Estoria de España*,<sup>24</sup> which lists, in chronological order, events from pagan, Christian, Jewish, and Islamic Spain. The *Estoria* starts in Seville with the appearance of Hercules and ends in the same city with Ferdinand III's triumphal entry. It gives an excellent account of the early stages in the Arabization of Spain in late antiquity by telling us how, shortly after the Moors arrived, the Mozarabs translated the holy scriptures into Arabic, their language.<sup>25</sup> The fact of these Arabic inscriptions in the church of St Romanus or others such as Cristo de Luz, also in Toledo, proves that, through Arabic, the Christian community could be mentioned and identified. Leaving aside the disagreements regarding its creation and completion, Alphonse's chronicle attempts the truly novel by honouring the Roman architects, the Visigothic kings (Leovigildo, Sisebuto, and Bamba), the Asturian kings (Alphonse II and Ramiro I), and the Cordoban emirs all in the same discourse. That is to say, nothing is left out. It speaks equally about the Roman bridge at Alcántara in Cáceres, the start of the mosque in Córdoba, the Asturian pre-Romanesque works at Monte Naranco in Oviedo, the cathedral at Santiago de Compostela, and the great minaret of the Almohad mosque in Seville (Fig. 5.3).

To put Roman, Visigothic, Umayyad, Asturian, and Almohad works on equal terms had a political objective. The chronicle makes it clear that there is an awareness that Spain in the 13th century springs from a rich and diverse cultural past. Just as a religion presents relics as the final and incontrovertible basis for its beliefs, the political discourse in the chronicle does likewise in recognizing the material heritage of the past, since within this preserved evidence lies the truthfulness of its claims. Like relics, *spolia* constitute a heritage that is also preserved deliberately.<sup>26</sup>

A few decades later, in the third quarter of the 14th century, Peter I built his palace in the heart of the Alcázar in Seville. Entering through the great triumphal arch from the Plaza de la Montería brings us to the majestic façade of the same name built in 1364 (Fig. 5.4).<sup>27</sup> We have noted above the value that

24 Inés Fernández-Ordóñez, "La transmisión textual de la 'Estoria de España' y de las principales 'crónicas' de ella derivadas," in *Alfonso X El Sabio y las crónicas de España*, ed. Inés Fernández-Ordóñez (Valladolid, 2000), pp. 219–60.

25 *Primera Crónica General de España*, ed. Ramón Menéndez Pidal (Madrid 1977), Chapter 571.

26 Juan Carlos Ruiz Souza, "Paisajes arquitectónicos del reinado de Alfonso X. Las Cantigas, Sevilla y el proyecto integrador del Rey Sabio," in *Alfonso X El Sabio (1221–1284). Las Cantigas de Santa María. Códice Rico Ms. T-I-1*, eds. Laura Fernández Fernández and Juan Carlos Ruiz Souza (Madrid, 2011), vol. 2, pp. 561–602.

27 Rafael Cómez Ramos, *El Alcázar del Rey Don Pedro*, (Seville, 2007); Antonio Almagro Gorgea, "Los palacios de Pedro I. La arquitectura al servicio del poder," *Anales de Historia del Arte* 23-2 (2013), 25–49.

the monuments of the past had in Alphonse X's works. In the Montería palace, we see his theory made tangible in a single architectural project. The façade with its inscriptions, the throne room with its gallery opening onto the square, and the hall giving access to the palace comprise an important declaration of intention to claim historical legitimacy. In Alphonse X's *Estoria de España* we see how elements from the Roman, Visigothic, and Andalusí past were used in a single discourse to define the contours of his reconfigured Spain. We can observe exactly the same process in the whole of the above-mentioned north gallery in Peter I's palace. The throne room, which is on the second floor and looks out onto the Plaza de la Montería through openings in the centre of the Montería façade, is located over the hall, where ancient columns stand, purposely selected from Roman and Visigothic material.<sup>28</sup> However, the appropriation of the past is not limited to this recycled material or *spolia* (Fig. 5.5). As with Alphonse's work, 10th-century Cordoba is also present. Umayyad capitals brought from far away, likely from Cordoba itself, are found inside the throne room and arranged across the whole façade, whose general design is a visual throwback to Almohad and Nasrid art.<sup>29</sup>

All the salvaged material is complemented by heraldry with castles and lions, inscriptions in Arabic and Spanish, and symbols of King Peter I, who used several means to ensure his presence.<sup>30</sup> The Montería façade has a large text of praise in Spanish that surrounds another in Arabic over the openings to the throne room. The Spanish inscription reads: The most high Don Pedro, by the grace of God king of Castile and León, ordered these fortresses and palaces and portals to be built, which was done in the year of one thousand, four hundred and two<sup>31</sup> (A.D. 1364) (Fig. 5.6). An inscription surrounding a large blue-and-white ceramic frieze is repeated eight times: And no conqueror except Allah.<sup>32</sup> It is curious that both the Christian and the Muslim names for God are invoked

28 Rafael Cómez Ramos, "Reutilización de materiales antiguos en la arquitectura mudéjar sevillana," in *História da construção os materiais*, eds. Arnaldo Sousa Melo and Maria Do Carmo Ribeiro (Braga 2012), pp. 77–88, especially 86–87.

29 Juan Carlos Ruiz Souza, "El Palacio de la Montería del Alcázar de Sevilla: contrapunto en el tardogótico," in *1514. Arquitectos tardogóticos en la encrucijada*, eds. Begoña Alonso and Juan Clemente Rodríguez (Seville, 2016), pp. 319–38.

30 Julie Marquer, "El poder escrito: problemáticas y significación de las inscripciones árabes de los palacios de Pedro I de Castilla (1350–1369)," in *Palacio y Génesis*, pp. 499–508; Rafael Valencia, "Las inscripciones árabes en el arte mudéjar," in *Mudéjar: El legado andalusí en la cultura española* (Zaragoza, 2010), p. 301.

31 El muy alto, et muy noble, et muy poderoso et muy conqueridor don Pedro por la gracia de Dios rey de Castiella et de León, mandó fazer estos alcázares et estos palacios et estas portadas que fue fecho en la era de mil et quatrocientos y dos (A.D. 1364).

32 "Y no vencedor sino Allah."

together with the name of King Peter, surrounded by such rich and varied *spolia*. Under the deictic inscription referring to the monarch, and above the gate leading into the palace, the previously mentioned gallery or platform of the large, high room opens, from which King Peter I could show himself. The king is present twice in the same façade due to the space reserved for him (the gallery) and the inscription above with his name, in the same central axis of the portal, so that there is a visual and textual meta-representation of the king. Thus, the palace can be understood as a huge theatrical set, the utmost symbol of the power of Peter I, whose reign is widely considered to have been pivotal in the development of the modern state.

#### 4 Was the Attitude of Jiménez de Rada, Alphonse X, and Peter I Something New? What Happened in Al-Andalus?

The many ground-breaking studies by Calvo Capilla open up new perspectives on the political circumstances surrounding the great construction projects of the Umayyads of Cordoba.<sup>33</sup> Just as scholars of medieval art have recently devoted much attention to the question of whether Christian Spain constituted a rupture or a continuity with the Visigothic and Andalusí past,<sup>34</sup> Calvo Capilla asks us to look at the political dimension of the city-palace of Madinat al-Zahra and the great mosque in Cordoba.<sup>35</sup> These works looked to Constantinople, just as the first Umayyad caliphs of Damascus did, but they also recognized Roman and Visigothic Hispania through the use of recycled materials. Some years ago, Antonio Peña proved that part of the most beautiful Roman material for enlarging the Cordoba mosque in the 9th century came directly from Mérida, at some distance (Fig. 5.7).<sup>36</sup> This is strange considering that Cordoba itself had numerous buildings and sites where first-class Roman and Visigothic materials could be found. It has been customary to interpret the Umayyad building projects in Cordoba in the shadow of, rather than parallel to, the expansionist projects of the Fatimids in North Africa. However, Calvo Capilla

33 Calvo Capilla, "Images and Knowledge of Classical Antiquity"; Susana Calvo Capilla, "La ampliación de la Mezquita de Córdoba: Mensajes, formas y funciones," *Goya* 323 (2008), 89–106.

34 Juan Carlos Ruiz Souza and Alexandra Uscatescu, "El 'occidentalismo' de Hispania y la Koiné artística mediterránea (siglos VII–VIII)," *Goya* 347 (2014), 95–115.

35 Susana Calvo Capilla, "Madinat al-Zhara y la observación del tiempo: el renacer de la Antigüedad Clásica en la Córdoba del siglo X," *Anales de Historia del Arte* 22-2 (2012), 131–60.

36 Antonio Peña, *Estudio de la decoración arquitectónica romana y análisis del reaprovechamiento de material en la mezquita aljama de Córdoba* (Córdoba 2010).

speaks of continuity in two senses: imitating the actions of the Umayyads in Damascus and reclaiming the Roman past of Hispania.<sup>37</sup> Some historical facts should be considered here; during its expansion westward, Islam met with Visigothic Hispania, a territory that, compared to the other regions where it spread in North Africa, was more consolidated and organized politically speaking (with its well-defined territory, capital in Toledo, single religion, and unified legal system). Thus, the Hispania of late antiquity provided al-Andalus with roots and gave it an identity that was distinct from the rest of Islam.

After the fall of the Cordoba caliphate and the dissolution of the Taifa kingdoms by Almoravid invaders, only the Almohad Empire had any real chance of creating a new Islamic empire in the west, of which Seville would become the capital between the final years of the 12th century and first decades of the 13th. Once more, the new political powers returned to the Peninsula's historical past as a source of legitimacy. The most important preserved building is the minaret of the great mosque, built at the end of the 12th century: the Giralda. Its study leads to some surprises, given that the tower is usually understood in the context of its Almohad model in North Africa.<sup>38</sup> As we ascend the tower, we find remnants of the most important moments in the Peninsula's past. The base still preserves a large set of Roman inscriptions (Fig. 5.8). Higher up, the Roman material is combined with Visigothic and Umayyads columns and capitals.<sup>39</sup> Therefore, the same historical-sequential display that Peter I put in his palace, also in Seville, in the third quarter of the 14th century can also be seen almost two centuries earlier. It is significant that King Peter could observe, or rather have a visual dialogue with, the great Almohad minaret from his elevated throne room in the palace. The two buildings have a similar political message: history, continuity, and legitimacy.

## 5 The Inclusion of Umayyads, Almohads, and Nasrids in Spain's History Following the Fall of Al-Andalus in 1492

In this work we have studied a long chronological period that ends in the first quarter of the 16th century. Thereafter, many ideological changes will take

37 Calvo Capilla, "La ampliación de la Mezquita de Córdoba."

38 Alfonso Jiménez and José María Cabeza, *Turris Fortissima. Documentos sobre la construcción, acrecentamiento y restauración de la Giralda* (Seville, 1988); Teodoro Falcón, *La Giralda. Rosa de los Vientos* (Seville, 1989); Teodoro Falcón, ed., *VIII Centenario de la Giralda (1198–1998)* (Córdoba, 1998).

39 Alfonso Jiménez Martín, "Notas sobre el laminar de la Aljama de Isbiliya," in *VIII Centenario de la Giralda*, ed. Falcón, pp. 31–43, especially p. 39.

place in Spanish society that will influence how the Andalusian past is understood, as Antonio Urquizar has shown in many studies.<sup>40</sup>

Al-Andalus *spolia* would end up being treated in the same way as Roman remains. In around 1500, Gutierrez de Cárdenas, a politician, humanist, and leading figure in the court of Isabel the Catholic, placed a whole series of capitals from the Cordoba caliphate on the great façade of the collegiate church at Torrijos (Toledo).<sup>41</sup> They were used as part of a classical design that reflects how singular Spain was in the early years of the 16th century (Fig. 5.9). The fact that Spanish architecture was still deliberately invoking the past was unique in the late Gothic period. Moreover, the Roman past was by then conflated with the Islamic past (thus Umayyad capitals could be thought appropriate for a classical design). It is impossible to find anything similar anywhere else, even in the Peninsula, according to a study by Amadeo Serra Desfilis on the Kingdom of Aragon.<sup>42</sup> Umayyad Cordoba was now seen as part of antiquity from the perspective of modern Spain.<sup>43</sup>

Sancho Ortiz de Matienzo, treasurer of the Casa de Contratación of Seville and canon of the Seville cathedral, ordered a relief from the Giralda, the most important Almohad structure in al-Andalus, to be used as the foundation stone of his chapel in the parish church of his birthplace, Villasana de Mena, in the north of the province of Burgos, in 1499, as stated in the inscription that still surrounds the image of the famous minaret on the stone. The most emblematic building in Almohad architecture now formed part of the most heartfelt collective memory at the end of the 15th century.<sup>44</sup>

40 Antonio Urquizar-Herrera, *Admiration and Awe: Morisco Buildings and Identity Negotiations in Early Modern Spanish Historiography* (Oxford, 2017).

41 Basilio Pavón Maldonado "Las columnas califales de la Colegiata de Torrijos (contribución del corpus del capitel hispano-musulmán)," *Al-Andalus* 31 (1966), 363–72.

42 Amadeo Serra Desfilis, "Convivencia, asimilación y rechazo: el arte islámico en el Reino de Valencia desde la conquista cristiana hasta las Germanías (circa 1230 – circa 1520)," in *Memoria y significado: uso y recepción de los vestigios del pasado*, ed. Luis Arciniega (Valencia, 2013), pp. 33–60.

43 It would be very interesting to think about the concept of antiquity in the following two centuries (16th and 17th), since Arab Spanish roots are often forgotten. Would it be possible to understand antiquity in different ways depending on different cultural frameworks? See Juan Carlos Ruiz Souza, "Antigüedad e historicismos en la España Medieval. El Real Alcázar de Sevilla y la Alhambra de Granada," in *L'Impero y le Hispanias da Traiano a Carlo v*, ed. Sandro De María and Manuel Parada (Bologna, 2014), pp. 439–54; Miguel Morán Turina, *La memoria de las piedras. Anticuarios, arqueólogos y coleccionistas de antigüedades en la España de los Austrias* (Madrid, 2010).

44 Leopoldo Torres Balbás, "Reproducciones de la Giralda anteriores a su reforma en el siglo XVI," *Al-Andalus* 6 (1941), 216–29.

Imitation of the Nasrids' Alhambra can also be seen in many Christian buildings sponsored by the monarchy and the nobility around 1500. To give but a few examples, the entrance gates to the city-palace of Granada served as the models for gates such as that preserved in Las Huelgas Reales in Valladolid or the portals of some Spanish churches, such as St Andrew in Aguilar de Campos in Valladolid, founded by the Admiral of Castile and Henry II's son, Fadrique Enríquez<sup>45</sup> (Fig. 5.10). The exterior walls of this church, especially the western one, are a deliberate allusion to the monumental gates of the Alhambra, the Siete Suelos gate in particular.

In the first part of this article, I talked about Archbishop Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada and the kings Alphonse X the Wise and Peter I the Cruel. I described Jiménez de Rada's church of St Romanus in Toledo and Peter I's palace in the Alcázar of Seville. But what work of art other than his valuable chronicles reflects Alphonse X's awareness of the uniqueness and cultural diversity that characterized the Kingdom of Castile? Without doubt, the monument that best demonstrates his deliberate conservation of the heritage of al-Andalus for the future is the marble epitaph that Alphonse X ordered to be placed on the tomb of his father, Ferdinand III, in Seville's cathedral, upon his death in 1252.<sup>46</sup> It has inscriptions in the four languages used in his territory – Latin, Arabic, Hebrew, and Spanish – all of them the same text in praise of the deceased monarch (Fig. 5.11). These inscriptions are joined with vertical bands, decorated with the castles and lions of royal heraldry. It is difficult to find a comparable document in the Middle Ages that so aptly expresses an inclusive discourse on the cultural wealth of the Kingdom of Castile and León. Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada and Alphonse X created the works that they did in the 13th century because they understood what Mozarabic Toledo meant in the previous century, when the famous School of Translators of Toledo began working with Archbishop Don Raimundo (1126–52). Scholars from the three religions made available to Europe the riches of ancient learning by systematically translating Arabic manuscripts on philosophy, mathematics, astronomy, astrology, medicine, etc. into Latin and Castilian. Thus, the recycling of the past by Alphonse X, Peter I, and Jiménez de Rada belongs to a long and unbroken tradition of constructing continuity out of the fragments of history.

45 Antonio Tovar Llorente, "La iglesia de San Andrés, de Aguilar de Campos," *Boletín de la Sociedad de Arte y Arqueología de Valladolid* 1 (1932–33), 16–26.

46 About the Royal Chapel and its epitaph, see Teresa Laguna Paul, "Una capilla mía que dicen de los reyes." Memoria de la Capilla Real de la Catedral mudéjar. La aljama cristianizada, de Santa María de Sevilla," in *La Capilla Real*, ed. Alfonso Jiménez Martín (Seville, 2012), pp. 17–233, especially pp. 220–29.



FIGURE 5.1 Church of St Romanus, ca. 1221  
TOLEDO (THIS CHURCH WAS BUILT BY RODRIGO JIMÉNEZ DE RADA)



FIGURE 5.2 *St. Leander (Hispanic Liturgy) and St. Ambrosius (Roman Liturgy)*, ca. 1221  
TOLEDO, CHURCH OF ST ROMANUS



FIGURE 5.3 La Giralda, Almohad minaret, 12th century  
SEVILLE



FIGURE 5.4 Montería façade, 1364  
SEVILLE, ROYAL ALCÁZAR



FIGURE 5.5 Hall of Peter I's palace with reused Roman and Visigothic spolia, 1364  
SEVILLE, ROYAL ALCÁZAR

Copyright © 2019, BRILL. All rights reserved.



FIGURE 5.6 Detail of the Montería façade, 1364  
SEVILLE, ROYAL ALCÁZAR



FIGURE 5.7 Roman capital from Mérida, reused in the Mosque of Cordoba in the  
9th century



FIGURE 5.8 Detail of Roman materials, La Giralda, Almohad minaret, 12th century SEVILLE



FIGURE 5.9 (a) Collegiate Church of the Blessed Sacrament, 16th century; (b) detail of Umayyad capitals from the 10th century  
FROM: FAÇADE OF THE COLLEGIATE CHURCH OF THE BLESSED SACRAMENT, DETAIL WITH, 16TH CENTURY, TORRIJOS, TOLEDO